



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

Compliance Plan against PGPR Report of QAA-HEC

Name of DAI: Fatima Jinnah Women University Date of Compliance Plan: December 9, 2020

Date of PGPR Visit: January 01-03, 2020 Date of PGPR Final Report: August 13, 2020

Summary of Statistics of all post-graduate Programs in HEI:

Ph.D. Programs	10	M.Phil./MS/Equivalent Programs	17
Ph.D. Qualified Faculty	85	M.Phil./MS/Equivalent Faculty	96
Ph.D. Students (Spring, 2020)	124	M.Phil./MS/Equivalent Students (Spring, 2020)	586



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

1. PROGRAM WISE

STATUS OF PROGRAMS AS PER PGPR REPORT							COMPLIANCE PLAN			
Sr.	Program Name	Program Level	No. of Enrolled Students	No. of Faculty Allocated		Status as per PGPR Report	Remarks / Deficiency	Description of Plan	Responsible Person / Department	Tentative Date of Completion
				PhD	MP hil / MS					
1	Environmental Sciences	PhD	30	13	0	FIS	Meeting minimum requirement, but 3 supervisors have more than 5 students under their supervision	<p>Response: The observations were addressed by the relevant committees/authorities. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure Ia)</p> <p>Action: As per program review finding, the limit is adjusted as per HEC policy. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure Ib)</p>	HoD, Department of Environmental Sciences and relevant authorities	November 24, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

2	Environmental Sciences (Chemistry)	PhD	09	13	0	FIS	Meeting minimum requirement but 3 supervisors have more than 5 students under their supervision	<p>Response: The observations were addressed by the relevant committees/authorities. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure I a)</p> <p>Action: As per program review finding, the limit is adjusted as per HEC policy. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure I b)</p>	HoD, Department of Environmental Sciences and relevant authorities	November 24, 2020
3	Environmental Sciences (Biotechnology)	PhD	11	13	0	FIS	Meeting minimum requirement but 3 supervisors have more than 5 students under their supervision	<p>Response: The observations were addressed by the relevant committees/authorities. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure I a)</p> <p>Action: As per program review finding, the limit is adjusted as per HEC policy. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure I b)</p>	HoD/ Department of Environmental Sciences and relevant authorities	November 24, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

4	English (Literature)	MPhil	36	02 (Regular) +01 (IPFP)	04	FIS	Excess of students and does not meet PhD faculty requirement	<p>Response: It is clarified that as per HEC policy, the MPhil in English (Literature) Program meets the requirement of having 2 regular PhD faculty members in the department for initiation and running of the MPhil degree program.</p> <p>There are currently two PhD faculty members in Department of English (Literature), namely:</p> <p>1. Dr. Shaheena Ayub Bhatti.</p> <p>She has been appointed as Professor in the Department of English (Literature) through Selection Board for 3 years (from 1 Aug, 2019 to 31 July 2022) and the contract is extendable to five years. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure IIa)</p> <p>Justification: Her Postdoc and teaching experience is in English</p>	Registrar and Chairperson, Department of English	2021
---	-------------------------	-------	----	----------------------------------	----	-----	---	---	---	------



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

							<p>Literature along with research publications hence she was recruited as Professor (English Literature).</p> <p>2. Dr. Uzma Imtiaz (Assistant Professor, TTS). Dr. Uzma has a PhD in English. <u>(Pls. Ref to Annexure IIb)</u></p> <p>3. Dr. Imran Ali, has been appointed as IPFP Fellow in Department of English (Literature). <u>(Pls. Ref to Annexure IIc)</u></p> <p>Action:</p> <p>1. An advertisement for hiring faculty member for the English Literature programs is in process. The faculty is planned to be hired by 2021.</p> <p>2. As per program review finding, the limit is adjusted as per HEC policy. <u>(Pls. Ref to Annexure II d)</u></p>		
--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

5	English (Literature)	PhD	16	02 (Regular) +01 (IPFP)	04	Halt	Does not meet the number of PhD faculty requirement.	<p>Action: TTS posts for one Assistant Professor (Literature) and one Associate Professor (Literature) are advertised. The hiring of TTS faculty will be completed before the start of the new session. (Limited applicants in two rounds. It has been advertised for the third time.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure III)</u></p> <p>The Department of English is also in the process of hiring Prof. Dr. Samina Amin Qadir (Ex. Vice Chancellor, FJWU) as Professor Emeritus. The initial processing of the application has been completed. The letter of expression and CV is attached for the evidence.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure IV)</u></p>	Registrar and Chairperson Department of English	2021
---	-------------------------	-----	----	----------------------------------	----	------	---	--	---	------



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

								FJWU Service Statuses approval is in final stages for appointment of adjunct and eminent faculty		
6	Biotechnology	MPhil	37	04 (Regular) + 02 (IPFP)	0	FIS	NOC Not Available	<p>Response: Department of Biotechnology submitted case for NOC to HEC however, HEC informed the Department that as the program was started in 2012, therefore, its entry in PQR is sufficient, and NOC is not required. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure V)</p> <p>Action: NOC applied and HEC informed that NOC is not required.</p>	Department/ HEC	May 13, 2020
7		PhD	4		0	FIS	NOC Not Available	<p>Response: NOC applied.</p> <p>Action: NOC is obtained with effect from 2018 and a copy of the NOC is attached. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure VI)</p>	Department/ HEC	August 06, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

3. OTHER FINDINGS

FINDINGS AS PER PGPR REPORT		COMPLIANCE PLAN		
Sr.	Description of Findings	Description of Plan	Responsible Person	Tentative Date of Completion
1	<p>Departmental Doctoral Program Committee (DDPC) and Doctoral Program Central Committee (DPCC) are not constituted.</p> <p>It is recommended that the University constitutes DDPC & DPCC in order to ensure discussion of courses/curriculum, synopses, matter pertaining to exams etc. in these committees. Constitution of these committees will provide facilitation to MPhil & PhD students.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <p>1. FJWU constituted a central FJWU MS/MPhil & PhD Program Review Committee in 2018. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure VIIa).</p> <p>2. In light of the recommendations of HEC reviewers in the exit meeting, the constitution of Departmental MPhil/Ph.D. Advisory committees has been approved in the 70th meeting of AS&RB dated January 20, 2020 comprising of at least one external member. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure VIIb).</p> <p>3. Departmental MS/MPhil and PhD Advisory Committee has been established in all departments offering MS/MPhil and PhD Programs at FJWU. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure VIIc).</p>	Registrar and Departmental MS/MPhil and PhD Advisory Committee	Jan 20, 2020
2	<p>A formal format of synopsis is not provided to MPhil and PhD students. In order to facilitate MPhil & PhD students, it is recommended that the University gets synopsis format approval by the concerned bodies and provide the same to MPhil & PhD students which would help them follow uniform pattern to prepare</p>	<p>Action:</p> <p>The FJWU MS/MPhil and PhD Program Review Committee has finalized the synopsis format and it is approved from AS&RB in its 74th meeting held from April 28-29, 2020 and also shared with students.</p>	FJWU MS/MPhil and PhD Program Review Committee and	Date of approval of document April 28-29, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

	synopsis and submit it on time. Moreover, it would help them in thesis write up.	<u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure VIII)</u>	Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory committees	Date of sharing document with Departments June 29, 2020.
3	MPhil and PhD synopses are not discussed / approved by BOS or DDPC nor feedback is taken by any external expert/s. Since there is no BOF in place in the University, it is recommended that MPhil and PhD synopses need to be formally approved by University bodies e.g. by DDPC and eminent experts from the relevant disciplines should be included in DDPC and ASRB to get their feedback at initial stages of conceptualization of research idea.	<p>Response: The MPhil and PhD synopses are presented before the AS&RB as per university policy.</p> <p>Action: The Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory Committees (DAC) have been revised with inclusion of external members. After discussion/approval of synopses by DACs, the same will be presented to AS&RB for approval.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure IX)</u></p>	Registrar & Departments Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory committees	January 20, 2020
4	PhD comprehensive examination is conducted by the department concerned by collating the test items prepared by the teachers concerned. External examiner/s (experts) are not involved in the preparation and marking of PhD comprehensive examination. It is recommended that in order to ensure objectivity and improving quality of PhD program, comprehensive exam to be finalized and marked by an external expert in the field	<p>As per FJWU Policy, comprehensive exams are conducted and evaluated internally.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure X)</u></p> <p>Furthermore, Departmental MS/MPhil and PhD Advisory Committees the inclusion of external members in the committees is approved by the university.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure VIIb)</u></p>	Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory committees and Exam office	As and when required June 17, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

5	<p>Currently, if an external examiner(s) suggest a PhD scholar to make changes/corrections in her thesis, only supervisor verifies revisions' report and revised copy is submitted to the controller office for further processing. It is recommended that the University develops a mechanism by which it is ensured that the changes / corrections proposed by the external/internal examiners are rectified by MPhil and PhD scholars in letter and spirit. There should be some objective way of verification of corrections made by the student on a proper Performa and either Dean of faculty or Chairperson of DPCC verifies changes and report is submitted to ASRB prior to forwarding revised copy of the thesis to the controller examination office.</p>	<p>FJWU MS/MPhil & PhD Program Review committee has developed a mechanism/SOPs (including a structured proforma) for objectively verifying the incorporation of suggested changes by the external and internal examiners. This is approved from AS&RB in its 74th meeting held from April 28-29, 2020. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure XI)</p>	<p>Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory committees and AS&RB</p>	
6	<p>Some of the external examiners from technologically advanced countries do not have official email ids. It is recommended that email correspondence with external examiners be made over their official email ids instead of their person email ids.</p>	<p>Noted. However, retired active researchers can evaluate theses, though they may not have official email IDs. Hence the comment should be retracted</p>	<p>Department/ Controller Exam Office</p>	<p>As and when required</p>
7	<p>Most of the external examiners (local) are from one or two institutions (from Islamabad) and there is repetition of the same examiners for the evaluation of MPhil and PhD programs. It is recommended that the University has a nationwide pool of examiners and involves them in evaluation of PhD theses. Moreover, same examiners not to be repeated for evaluation of MPhil and PhD students' theses</p>	<p>Action: The concerned departments are directed to expand the pool of expert examiners for MPhil and PhD programs. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure XII)</p>	<p>Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory Committee and Departments</p>	<p>November 12, 2020</p>
8	<p>It is also recommended that a proper PhD thesis evaluation Performa for external examiners is prepared in order to get formal feedback and uniform evaluation of PhD theses.</p>	<p>Thesis Evaluation Proforma has been prepared by Examinations Office, and approved by AS&RB and also disseminated to the Departments. (Pls. Ref. to Annexure XIII)</p>	<p>Exam office and AS&RB</p>	<p>April 28-29, 2020</p>



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

9	A faculty with PhD Sociology is heading Department of Public Administration.	<p>Justification: The concerned InCharge was hired as a faculty member in Public Administration department, because her Teaching experience and Research focus is based on areas, which come under the discipline of both Business and Public Administration, and her foreign MSc in Regional Development Planning further makes her eligible to teach in the Department of Public Administration. Dr. Asma Khalid teaches the same courses in Public Administration Programs which she studied in her MBA program. Since she is part of the department, she can be the InCharge of the department.</p> <p><u>(Pls. ref. to Annexure XIV)</u> for the details on the list of her taught courses, copy of her degrees and research publications.</p>	Registrar Office	
10	It is recommended that PhD scholars' bi-annual Progress Reports are made a regular feature in order to monitor their regular progress and ensure timely completion of PhD work.	<p>Response: The university has a practice of maintaining Annual Progress Reports of MPhil and PhD students.</p> <p>Action: Noted for compliance. QEC periodically communicates the submission of Progress Reports on bi-annual basis to all concerned departments on the HEC prescribed proforma <u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure XV)</u>.</p>	QEC & DAC	Biannual
11	Ph.D program is being offered with even one or two students in a number of disciplines. It is recommended that a minimum number of PhD students be considered in order to run PhD classes.	<p>Response: As per HEC, this is not binding on the universities. The PhD programs at FJWU are in line with the universal practice in the public sector universities.</p>		



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

12	It is recommended that formal Notifications are issued to the concerned student/supervisor/head of the department based on decisions taken regarding MPhil and PhD programs in AS&RB and other statutory bodies.	<p>Response: The Secretary AS&RB sends notification letters to the HoDs, student and supervisor.</p> <p>Action: Complied.</p> <p><i>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure XVI)</i></p>	Secretary AS&RB/Registrar	November 03, 2020
13	In Biotechnology & Chemistry, MPhil & PhD Programs were previously offered under the Umbrella of Department of Environment Sciences but recently Biotechnology and Chemistry Departments have been approved by the syndicate as separate departments. Subsequently (in 2018), Biochemistry department started to offer MPhil and PhD programs under the umbrella of Biotechnology department without obtaining NOC by HEC. It is recommended that Department of Biotechnology applies for NOCs to HEC in order to offer post graduate degree programs and till then fresh intake in these programs is stopped.	<p>Action: NOC for MPhil is not required. Pls. see Annexure V for details.</p> <p>NOC for PhD has been obtained from HEC by the Department of Biotechnology. Pls. see Annexure VI for details.</p>	Department of Biotechnology	May 13, 2020 August 06, 2020
14	In few departments, MPhil and PhD programs are being run without required number of PhD faculty and further induction of students without enhancing the number of PhD faculty may create serious imbalance in some departments. It is recommended that in these departments, fresh intake in these programs is stopped till induction of new PhD faculty or completion of required number of PhD faculty.	<p>Response: Please refer to the response provided in section: <i>Program wise Findings, point 7.</i></p> <p>Action: The number of faculty members will be increased by fresh hiring by 2021.</p>		November, 2020 2021
15	Academic-Industry linkage was observed to be weak at the University. It is recommended that University develops Academia-Industry linkage in order to facilitate MPhil & PhD students in their research work.	<p>Response and Action: University-industry partnership projects are already going on in the university, such as research of students e.g. ICT fund and</p>	ORIC & Departments	



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

		<p>IGNITE fund where 10 students are benefitting from such partnerships.</p> <p>Further partnerships are being developed and MoUs being signed for Industry-Academia linkages, esp. in the areas of Research and Community Development. ORIC is actively facilitating the departments to seek and establish such linkages.</p> <p><u><i>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure XVII).</i></u></p>		
16	<p>Statutory bodies' meetings were not regularly held by the University. It is recommended that the University holds regular meetings of the statutory bodies for smooth functioning of the University and to take timely decisions pertaining to MPhil & PhD programs.</p>	<p>Response: The frequency of meetings of the statutory bodies such as AS&RB, Academic Council and Syndicate is reasonable. In case of any urgent matter to be dealt with, the frequency of the meetings is increased to address the issue on a timely basis.</p> <p>For evidence <u><i>(Pls Ref. to Annexure XVIII).</i></u></p>	Registrar Office	2020
17	<p>No orientation/awareness sessions are conducted for MPhil & PhD programs to orient them about University and HEC's policies. It is recommended that the University holds orientation sessions of MPhil & PhD students soon after admissions so that they are informed about University's rules and regulations and HEC's policies related to MPhil & PhD programs. University may consider preparing student handbook containing all University rules / regulations and HEC's policies for students' facilitation.</p>	<p>Response: The orientation of all newly inducted students, including MPhil and PhD students, is a regular feature at the start of a semester at FJWU. The university administration as well as Departments hold Student Orientations to the university Vision, Mission and policies, Administrative Offices, Library, Lab, Medical, Sports Day Care/ECCC facilities, Departmental programs and</p>	Registrar Office and Department	September 08, 2020



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

		<p>their requirements, and curricular and co-curricular activities.</p> <p><u>(Pls. Ref. To Annexure XIX)</u></p> <p>Action: Additionally, the ‘Student Handbook’ has been finalized and is ready for circulation. Also, currently all the rules and regulations are mentioned in the prospectus and are also made available on the university website.</p>		
18	It is recommended that the University provides proper office space / desks to PhD students where they can sit and work on their theses with full concentration.	<p>Two rooms in Faculty of Education Block are allocated to PhD students, where they may use the internet facilities for academic research as well as work on their theses.</p> <p><u>(Pls.Ref. to Annexure XX)</u></p>	Room Allocation Committee	
19	In some disciplines, there is shortage of lab facility for MPhil & PhD students. E.g. Department of Behavioral Sciences does not have testing lab nor does it have minimum required original psychological tests / scales for MPhil & PhD students to use in their course work and research work. The department has a few cabinets lying in the corridor and most of the tests are photocopied, which is serious violation of copyright. Moreover, there is no proper room or lab where psychological tests can be administered. It is recommended that proper testing lab is established and it is equipped with original psychological tests/scales.	<p>Response: All Psychological tests are Copyrighted.</p> <p><u>(Pls.Ref. to Annexure XXI)</u></p> <p>Action:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Psychological tests are placed in the office of Department Coordinator. 2. The cupboards have been placed in a designated room of the department. 3. Psychology Lab/Center for administrating tests is allocated. 	Department of Behavioral Sciences	
20	In the Department of Environmental Sciences, 3 faculty members are supervising more than 5 PhD students despite having ample number of PhD faculty members in the department. This is a serious violation of HEC rules. It is recommended that fresh intake in the	<p>Response: This observation is already addressed earlier under <i>points 2, 3 and 4 of Program wise Findings.</i></p>		



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

	concerned programs is stopped and surplus number of students are assigned to other available supervisors within the department through ASRB.			
21	The Department of English offers PhD in literature with one Ph.D. faculty member and other is on contract. Thus minimum requirement is not met. Therefore, Ph.D. program of English Literature is halted & further intake in MS/M.Phil. Literature program of the department is stopped till the question of excess of students is addressed and minimum requirement of PhD faculty as per HEC criteria is made.	Response: This observation is already addressed earlier under <i>point 7 and 8 of Program wise Findings.</i>		
22	Public defense of a PhD scholar was conducted without article been published which is prerequisite for the award of PhD. This is a very serious anomaly and University needs to refrain from such practices in future.	Response: There is no violation of HEC rules for the award of degree to any PhD student at FJWU. HEC rules advise to “award the degree” after a publication. The degree to all PhD students is awarded after the publication of a paper. Please note that as per HEC rules there is no condition of publication to conduct the viva of a PhD scholar. <u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure XXII)</u>	Exam Office and Departmental MS/MPhil & PhD Advisory Committee	
23	The PhD Degree was awarded by the University to a scholar who had an adverse report on her PhD thesis by an examiner who did not approve award of PhD degree. This is also a very serious anomaly and violation of HEC rules.	Response: FJWU strictly follows the HEC criteria for PhD thesis evaluation. In the specific case, two evaluation reports were sought on PhD thesis to get the examiners feedback, which were subsequently presented in AS&RB as per HEC requirement. However, an incomplete thesis evaluation report was received from one of the external evaluator leading to the subsequent change of	Exam Office	



HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION

Sector H-9, Islamabad

		external evaluator in accordance with the directives of 68 th AS&RB meeting. The justification for the third evaluation report is attached. <i><u>(Pls. Ref. to Annexure XXIII)</u></i>		
24	It was complained by the M.Phil. PhD students that within the university students/scholars were charged with separate fees for using any lab or other research facility in other departments of the university. It is recommended that all the departments must collaborate with each other and allow the students/scholars to use their labs or other research facilities without charging any separate fees from students.	Response: The university charges no additional fee amount from students on using any lab facility. All labs facilities are available to students. Where labs are shared, they are available as per the lab class schedule upon request from one department to the other.		
25	It was observed and complained by students/scholars that canteen charges per item were quite high than the normal rates of the market. It is recommended that this issue may be addressed adequately without any compromise on quality.	There is a Cafeteria Committee which takes care of food price control and quality as well. The rates cannot be increased without university approval.	FJWU Cafeteria Committee	